



Guide to Noise Claims

Chris Fry
Managing Partner, Unity Law

Theo Huckle QC
Doughty Street Chambers

With assistance from
Joseph Wynn
Barrister, KBW Chambers



Published by Jordan Publishing, owned by LexisNexis

Jordan Publishing
Regus
Terrace Floor
Castlemead
Lower Castle Street
Bristol BS1 3AG

© Jordan Publishing 2016

Whilst the publishers and the author have taken every care in preparing the material included in this work, any statements made as to the legal or other implications of any transaction, any particular method of litigation or any kind of compensation claim are made in good faith purely for general guidance and cannot be regarded as a substitute for professional advice. Consequently, no liability can be accepted for loss or expense incurred as a result of relying in particular circumstances on statements made in this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any way or by any means, including photocopying or recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher.

Crown Copyright material is reproduced with kind permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978 1 84661 928 1

Typeset by Letterpart Limited, Caterham on the Hill, Surrey CR3 5XL

Printed in Great Britain by Hobbs the Printers Limited, Totton, Hampshire SO40 3WX

CONTENTS

Preface	v
Association of Personal Injury Lawyers (APIL)	vii
Table of Cases	xv
Table of Statutes	xvii
Table of Statutory Instruments	xix
Table of EC Materials	xxi
Glossary	xxiii
Chapter 1	
Breach of Duty: Development of the Regulatory Framework on Noise	1
1.1 Overview	1
1.2 1963 – ‘Noise and the Worker’	2
1.3 1963 – The Wilson Committee Final Report on the Problem of Noise	4
1.4 1968 – ‘Protection from Head to Toe’	5
1.5 1968 – ‘Noise and the Worker’	5
1.6 1968 – The textbook ‘Noise and Man’ by Professor William Burns	5
1.7 1970 – The Teddington Conference (published for the British Acoustical Society – 1971)	6
1.8 1970 – Hearing and Noise in Industry	6
1.9 1971 – ‘Noise and the Worker’	6
1.10 1972 – The Code of Practice for Reducing the Exposure of Employed Persons to Noise	7
1.11 1973 – The NPL Tables	8
1.12 1975 – ISO 1999	11
1.13 1976 – BS5330 ‘Method of Test for Estimating the Risk of Hearing Handicap due to Noise Exposure’	12
1.14 1979 – Lancet 2: 1067 Editorial ‘Trade Union Action on Noise Induced Deafness’	12
1.15 1981 – Health and Safety Commission Report: ‘Some Aspects of Noise and Hearing Loss’	12
1.16 1982 – HSC Consultative document ‘Protection of Hearing at Work’	13
1.17 1986 – The Noise Act Work Directive	14
1.18 1987 – HSC Consultative Document ‘Prevention of Damage to Hearing from Noise at Work – Draft Proposals for Regulation and Guidance’	14

1.19	1987 – HSE Contract Research Report Number 1/1987 ‘Noise Exposure and Hearing, a New Look at the Experimental Data’, Robinson	15
1.20	1989 – The Noise at Work Regulations	15
1.21	1989 – HSE Guide Number 1	16
1.22	1990 – ISO 1999	16
1.23	1991 – the IRS Guide to Noise at Work Regulations	16
1.24	1992 – the HSE Guide to the Noise at Work Regulations	17
1.25	1994 – HSE Contract Research Report Number 68/1994 – ‘Occupational Hearing Loss from Low-Level Noise’ Robinson, Lawton and Rice	17
1.26	2003 – Regulatory Impact Assessment of the Physical Agents (Noise Directive) (1992/0449A C0D)	17
1.27	2003 – Directive 2003/10/EC: Physical Agents (Noise)	18
1.28	2005 – The Control of Noise at Work Regulations	19
1.29	2013 – The Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013	19

Chapter 2

Engineering Evidence		21
2.1	How to Measure Noise at Work	21
2.2	Measuring Noise Exposure Equipment	22
	Assessing and challenging the validity of measurements	22
2.3	Hearing Protection	24
2.4	How to Assess the Magnitude of Noise Exposure	26
2.5	Frequency Weightings	27
2.6	Noise Immission Levels	28
2.7	Case Study 1 – Mr A Steadyworker v Engineering Ltd Exposure duration	28
	Exposure estimate	29
2.8	Case Study 2: A Goodchap v Plant Hire Ltd Exposure history	31
	Exposure duration	33
	Exposure Estimate	35

Chapter 3

Limitation		37
3.1	Background	37
3.2	Statutory framework Accrual of cause of action	37
	Knowledge	38
	Significance of injury (s 14(1)(a))	39
	Attributable to the act or omission (s 14(1)(b))	43
	Knowledge of the identity of the defendant (s 14(1)(c))	44
3.3	Constructive knowledge (s 14(3))	45
3.4	Discretion Discretion to allow a case to proceed outside of the limitation period	51

	The length of, and reasons for the delay – section 33(3)(a)	52
	The effect of any delay on the cogency of the evidence – section 33(3)(b)	52
	The conduct of the defendant – section 33(3)(c)	53
	The duration of any disability of the claimant arising after accrual of the cause of action – section 33(3)(d)	54
	The extent to which the claimant acted promptly and reasonably – section 33(3)(e)	54
	The steps taken by the claimant to obtain medical, legal or other expert advice – section 33(3)(f)	54
3.5	Expiry of limitation period	55
3.6	Extending limitation period by agreement	56
3.7	Practical points regarding limitation	56
Chapter 4		
Medical Diagnosis		59
4.1	Introduction	59
4.2	Credibility of the audiogram	59
	Approach to clinical diagnosis and the court’s finding	60
	Route map to diagnosis: a visualisation	64
	Asymmetry in audiograms	64
	Tinnitus	65
4.3	Quantifying the NIHL	67
	Practical example: the case of Mr Goodchap	67
4.4	Guidelines for quantification of noise-induced hearing loss in a medicolegal context (The New Guidelines)	71
	Background to the new guidelines	71
	The ‘short-cut method’	75
	Summary of practical value	76
	The new quantification method in detail	76
	Pass One	76
	Pass Two	79
	Binaural NIHL	80
	Short-cut Method	80
	Worked Examples applying the Full Method	81
	Example 1: Mr Goodchap	81
	Male 54 years of age (TDH 39 headphones used)	81
	Pass One	81
	Pass Two	83
	Example 2: Mrs Goodwoman	86
	Female 44 years of age (TDH 49 headphones used)	86
	Pass One	86
	Pass Two	88
	Short-cut Method	90
4.5	Practical points	91

Chapter 5	
Quantum	93
5.1 General damages	93
5.2 Special damages	94
5.3 Worked example	96
5.4 Apportionment of compensation award	97
Chapter 6	
Dealing with a Deafness Enquiry	99
6.1 Triage for noise cases	99
6.2 Client Questionnaire	101
6.3 Checklist	101
6.4 Employment history	101
(1) The work environment	102
(2) System of work	102
(3) Multiple employers	102
6.5 Which defendant?	104
6.6 Legal status of defendant/insurance	104
6.7 Company No Longer Trading	105
6.8 Restoring a Company to the Register	106
Chapter 7	
Deafness Claims under the Pre Action Protocol for Low Value Personal Injury (Employers' Liability and Public Liability)	107
7.1 Introduction	107
7.2 Scope of the Protocol	108
Disease claims – definition	108
Claims excluded from the Protocol	109
7.3 Disqualification from entry to the Portal	109
7.4 Stage 1	109
Claim Notification Form (CNF)	109
Acknowledgment	110
Response	111
7.5 Stage 2	111
7.6 Stage 3	112
7.7 Hearing	113
7.8 Stage 3 Costs	113
7.9 Disbursements	114
7.10 The impact of the Portal	115
Appendix 1	
Template Noise Induced Hearing Loss Questionnaire	119
Appendix 2	
Model Letters, Pleadings and Applications	125
A2.1 Pre-Letter of Claim Notification	126
A2.2 Letter of Claim	128
A2.3 Pre-Action Disclosure Application	132

A2.4 The Application

135

Index

161