

Local Authority Liability

Sixth Edition

John Morrell

His Honour Judge Richard Foster

Published by
Jordan Publishing Limited
21 St Thomas Street
Bristol BS1 6JS

Whilst the publishers and the author have taken every care in preparing the material included in this work, any statements made as to the legal or other implications of particular transactions are made in good faith purely for general guidance and cannot be regarded as a substitute for professional advice. Consequently, no liability can be accepted for loss or expense incurred as a result of relying in particular circumstances on statements made in this work.

© Jordan Publishing Ltd 2015

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any way or by any means, including photocopying or recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher.

Crown Copyright material is reproduced with kind permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978 1 78473 100 7

Typeset by Letterpart Ltd, Caterham on the Hill, Surrey CR3 5XL

Printed in Great Britain by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

CONTENTS

Contributors	v
Foreword to the Sixth Edition	vii
Preface to the Sixth Edition	ix
Foreword to the Fifth Edition	xi
Foreword to the Fourth Edition	xiii
Foreword to the Third Edition	xv
Foreword to the Second Edition	xvii
Foreword to the First Edition	xix
Table of Cases	xxxi
Table of Statutes	lix
Table of Statutory Instruments	lxiii
Table of European Materials	lxv
Chapter 1	
Introduction to Duties Owed by Local Authorities	1
Introduction	1
Negligence	1
The basic rule	1
Negligent acts	2
Negligent statements	2
Public authorities and <i>Hedley Byrne</i>	2
Assumption of responsibility	4
Novel duties of care	5
Incremental development of new duties of care	6
‘The three-stage approach’	6
‘Fair, just and reasonable’ – ‘public policy’	9
Public policy and the European Convention of Human Rights	10
Should the common law develop in harmony with the Human Rights Act 1998?	13
Local authorities’ liabilities arising out of the performance of statutory duties	15
Local authorities and the assumption of responsibility	24
Liability to owners of neighbouring properties for acts by third parties	28
Liability generally for acts of third parties	31
Economic loss	34
Local authority as a single entity	37
Compensation Act 2006	38

Social Action, Responsibility and Heroism Act 2015	39
The Corporate Manslaughter and Corporate Homicide Act 2007	39
Nuisance	40
Nature of nuisance	40
Damages	42
Reasonableness and foreseeability as elements in nuisance	43
Measured duty	43
Trees falling on the highway	46
Liability for nuisance caused by others	46
The purchaser of a property	46
Independent contractor	47
Withdrawal of support	47
Defences – coming to the nuisance and inevitable accident	48
Statutory authority	48
The rule in <i>Rylands v Fletcher</i>	49
Misfeasance in public office	50
Chapter 2	
Human Rights Act 1998	55
Introduction	55
European Convention on Human Rights	55
Human Rights Act 1998	57
Public authority	58
Relief available under the Act	59
Declaration of incompatibility	59
Implications: liability of local authorities	60
The right to a fair and public hearing – the impact of Art 6 and Art 13 on the common law	60
A new basis for claims against public authorities	66
How has the Act changed the courts' approach to the duty owed by public authorities at common law?	67
Implications of the Act: specific matters	70
Social services	70
Education	73
The right to education	73
Religious and philosophical convictions and Art 9 – freedom of thought, conscience and religion	74
The police	75
The environment	77
Highways	79
Housing	79
Damages against public authorities	81
Pecuniary damages	82
Non-pecuniary damages	83
Limitation	85
Conclusion	86

Chapter 3	
Social Services	87
Introduction	87
The statutory framework	87
Inquiries	88
Claims	88
<i>X (Minors) v Bedfordshire County Council</i>	90
Breach of statutory duty	90
Common law duties	91
The authorities since <i>X (Minors)</i>	93
The impact of the European Court of Human Rights on <i>X (Minors)</i>	95
<i>J D v East Berkshire Community Health NHS Trust and Others</i>	98
Fostering	100
<i>W v Essex County Council</i>	100
Claim by Foster Parent for Personal Injury	106
Adoption	107
Other claims	108
Investigation of child abuse	108
Claim for compensation on behalf of child in care	109
Protecting council tenants from the actions of third parties	109
Looking after persons with mental illnesses	111
Misfeasance in public office	111
Negligent misstatement	112
Direct/vicarious liability	113
Other remedies	113
Nature of the damage	114
Employment	114
The impact of the Human Rights Act 1998	115
Allegations of abuse in children's homes	116
Vicarious liability in abuse cases	117
Limitation	119
Disclosure of documents	124
Conclusion	124
Chapter 4	
Education – The Liability of Teachers and Local Education Authorities	127
The nature of the duty	127
Accidents in the classroom	130
Accidents in the gymnasium	133
Accidents in the playground	135
Accidents before the beginning of the school day	140
Accidents occurring after school	142
Safety of premises	144
Travelling to and from school	146
Injuries on the sports field	148
Liability for activities outside school	153
School trips	153
Work experience	157

Liability of schools for bullying	157
Bullying – Human Rights Act 1998	161
Failure to educate	161
<i>Phelps v London Borough of Hillingdon</i>	163
House of Lords’ decision	165
Personal injury or economic loss	166
What is the relevant limitation period?	168
Actual knowledge – Limitation Act 1980, s 14(1)	168
Constructive knowledge – Limitation Act 1980, s 14(3)	169
Discretion under Limitation Act 1980, s 33	171
Courts’ approach to <i>Phelps v London Borough of Hillingdon</i>	172
Generally	172
Claims against teachers	173
Claims alleging negligence by educational psychologists	175
Claims against local education authorities direct and against their officers	177
Approach to causation	181
Damages	183
The impact of the Human Rights Act 1998	184
Chapter 5	
Housing and Occupier’s Liability	189
Introduction	189
Liabilities of local authorities as landlords	189
Common law position	189
Position of landlord who has designed or built the premises	190
Interpretation of covenant for quiet enjoyment	192
Landlord and Tenant Act 1985	193
What is the structure and exterior of the dwelling house?	194
Is notice required for liability under s 11 Landlord and Tenant Act 1985?	202
Landlord must have reasonable time to carry out repairs	205
Buildings containing more than one leasehold property	206
Liability for breach of repairing covenant after order for possession	207
Nuisance	207
Damages	209
Where can a local authority, as landlord, be liable for the tenant’s torts?	212
Implications of the Human Rights Act 1998	213
Defective Premises Act 1972	214
Duties to homeless persons	219
Occupier’s liability	219
Meaning of occupier	220
No duty under Occupiers Liability Act 1957 in relation to footpaths	221
The duty owed to visitors	223
Cases concerned with premises	225

Cases involving activities	231
Consideration of the existence of a duty of care – trespassers	235
Desirable activities	242
Independent contractors	245
Restricting liability	247
Chapter 6	
Employer’s Liability	249
Introduction	249
When will the local authority be seen as the employer (to whom is the duty owed)?	252
Nature of the duty	256
The European dimension	259
Duties owed	264
Place of work	264
Workplace (Health, Safety and Welfare) Regulations 1992	266
What is a workplace for the purpose of the Regulations?	266
Floors in the Workplace – Slipping and Tripping	267
Obstructions on the floor	270
Stairways	271
The place of work – section 69 of the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013	273
System of work	275
Manual Handling Operations Regulations 1992	278
When is it reasonably practicable to avoid the need for manual handling?	280
Where manual handling cannot be avoided	281
Risk assessment	281
Information and training	284
Manual Handling – Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013	285
Equipment	286
Provision and Use of Work Equipment Regulations 1998	287
Personal Protective Equipment at Work Regulations 1992	294
Work equipment – the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013	297
Direct reliance on the EU Directives – emanations of the State	299
Competent fellow employees	301
Vicarious liability	302
Bullying and harassment	303
Duty to protect employees from the acts of third parties	307
Industrial disease: Asbestos – pleural plaques and mesothelioma	309
When does the cause of action arise?	310
Pleural plaques	311
Free-standing psychiatric injury	311
Mesothelioma – causation	312
Mesothelioma	315
Breach of duty	315
Apportionment of liability	317

Limitation	318
Insurance – what triggers employers liability insurance?	318
Nervous shock/post-traumatic stress disorder	320
Stress in the workplace	321
Psychiatric injury as a result of disciplinary proceedings	328
Contributory negligence	330
Conclusion	331
Chapter 7	
Highways	333
Introduction	333
What is a highway?	333
The extent of the highway	336
Who is the highway authority?	339
The statutory duty	342
Pavement tripping cases	345
The size of the defect	348
The position of the defect	349
Defects in the carriageway – pedestrians	351
Defects in the carriageway – cyclists and motorists	352
The assessment of dangerousness	352
Transient defects	354
Ice and snow on the highway	358
Position before 31 October 2003	358
Position after 31 October 2003	360
Is there a duty to clear snow and ice or take preventive measures other than under s 41(1A) of the Highways Act 1980?	361
Drainage of the Highway	363
The statutory defence	364
The relevance of the National Code of Practice	369
What evidence is relevant?	372
Position of contractors and statutory bodies	376
Contributory negligence	379
Common law negligence	381
Does a common law duty of care arise out of the highway authority's discretionary powers?	384
Chapter 8	
Environmental Liabilities	395
Introduction	395
Nuisance	395
Basic principles of nuisance	395
Private nuisance defined	396
Encroachment on a neighbour's land	396
Causing physical damage to land	396
Interference with enjoyment	396
Foreseeability	397

Reasonableness	398
Construction: demolition and building	400
Character of the neighbourhood	400
The relevance of the grant of planning permission	401
Natural nuisances	402
The measured duty of care	402
Who is entitled to sue?	406
Coming to the nuisance	407
Who is liable?	408
Drainage	408
The rule in <i>Rylands v Fletcher</i>	409
Basic principles	409
‘Accumulation for defendant’s own purposes’	410
The ‘non-natural user’ principle	411
Foreseeability in <i>Rylands v Fletcher</i>	414
Who can sue under the rule in <i>Rylands v Fletcher</i> ?	416
Liability in nuisance and under the rule in <i>Rylands v Fletcher</i> when a local authority is performing a statutory duty	418
Remedies in nuisance and under the rule in <i>Rylands v Fletcher</i>	422
Negligence	424
Background	424
Liability in negligence where a local authority is exercising a statutory duty or power	425
Failing to take proper steps to protect an individual or company from the tortious activities of a third party	431
Liability for negligent advice or negligence in the performance of a regulatory duty	432
Economic loss	434
Limitation	436
Environmental Protection Act 1990	437
Background	437
Breach of statutory duty	437
The duty as regulator	438
Human Rights Act 1998	439
Chapter 9	
Advice and Information	441
Introduction	441
The basic law	441
Effect of the Human Rights Act 1998	453
Enquiries of local authorities	455
Local Land Charges Act 1975	455
Accrual of cause of action	460
Duty of care not accepted	461
Planning functions	461
Environmental health functions	471
Health and Safety	473
Building control functions	474

Grant functions	475
Social services and education functions	476
The 'right to buy' legislation	480
Conclusion	481
Chapter 10	
Emergency Services	483
Introduction	483
The police	483
Fire and rescue authorities	484
Vicarious Liability	484
The duty of care owed by the emergency services – general position	486
Investigation of crime	487
Can a special relationship give rise to a duty to investigate crime?	492
Prosecution of offences	494
Duty to witnesses	496
The duty owed to persons in custody	499
Other circumstances in which the existence of a duty has been considered	502
Liability of the police for damage to property	505
Fire and rescue authorities	507
Statutory provisions	508
Is there a common law duty on the fire brigade to answer calls to fires or to take reasonable care to do so?	508
Does the fire brigade owe a duty of care to the owner of property or to anyone else to whom the fire may spread once they have arrived at the scene?	509
Proximity	510
Immunity	511
Statutory liability – s 13 of the Fire Services Act 1947	512
The distinction between positive acts and a failure to prevent harm	513
Fire Precautions Regulations	514
The ambulance service	514
Conclusion	515
Chapter 11	
Trees	517
Introduction	517
Nuisance and trees – the original understanding	517
<i>Leakey and Others v National Trust for Places of Historical Interest or Natural Beauty</i>	518
Existing law of nuisance in tree root cases	519
Solloway v Hampshire County Council	519
Is the highway authority responsible for the tree?	520
Common law	520
Statutory background	520
Do the statutory provisions vest ownership of trees in the highway authority?	521

Ownership of trees planted before adoption of the highway – the concept of control	522
Trees planted or self-sown after adoption	524
Trees planted before adoption of the highway	525
Can the claimant sue?	526
Delaware Mansions Ltd v Westminster City Council	527
When does the cause of action accrue?	530
Establishing liability in tree root nuisance	531
Causation	531
Foreseeability	534
Reasonable care	538
Reasonableness between neighbours – is notice required?	539
Negligence	541
Breach of statutory duty	541
Liability in relation to falling trees	542
Remedies	546
Damages	546
Injunction	546
Abatement of nuisance – trees subject to tree preservation orders	548
Index	549