

# Rights of Light

Third Edition

**Stephen Bickford-Smith MA (Oxon), FCI Arb**

Barrister and Chartered Arbitrator  
A Master of the Bench of the Inner Temple  
Landmark Chambers, London

**Andrew Francis MA (Oxon)**

Barrister  
A Master of the Bench of Lincoln's Inn  
Serle Court, 6 New Square, London

**Tom Weekes BA (Oxon)**

Barrister  
Landmark Chambers, London

*With contributions from*

Andrew Cartmell  
Director  
Point 2 Surveyors

Mark Davies  
Associate Director of UK  
Underwriting  
Stewart Title Ltd

Richard Clarke BCL (Oxon),  
LLB (Soton)  
Barrister  
Landmark Chambers, London

Alistair Mills BCL (Oxon),  
MA (Cantab)  
Barrister  
Landmark Chambers, London

Published by  
Jordan Publishing Limited  
21 St Thomas Street  
Bristol BS1 6JS

Whilst the publishers and the author have taken every care in preparing the material included in this work, any statements made as to the legal or other implications of particular transactions are made in good faith purely for general guidance and cannot be regarded as a substitute for professional advice. Consequently, no liability can be accepted for loss or expense incurred as a result of relying in particular circumstances on statements made in this work.

© Jordan Publishing Limited 2015

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any way or by any means, including photocopying or recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher.

Crown Copyright material is reproduced with kind permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

**British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978 1 84661 863 5

Typeset by Letterpart Limited, Caterham on the Hill, Surrey CR3 5XL

Printed in Great Britain by Hobbs the Printers Limited, Totton, Hampshire SO40 3WX

# CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	v
Foreword	vii
Preface to the Third Edition	ix
Preface to the First Edition	xi
Table of Abbreviations	xv
Table of Cases	xxvii
Table of Statutes	xliii
Table of Statutory Instruments	xlix
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>The Property Law Context</b>	<b>1</b>
Easements in property law	1
The essentials of easements	8
1. There must be a dominant and a servient tenement	9
2. The easement must accommodate the dominant tenement	9
3. The dominant and servient tenements must be in separate ownership	10
4. The easement must be capable of forming the subject matter of a grant	12
Other categorisations of easements	12
Easements distinguished from other rights over land	14
<b>Chapter 2</b>	
<b>Rights of Light Defined and Contrasted</b>	<b>17</b>
The right defined	17
The limits of protection	18
Regulation of high hedges	21
Licences and other arrangements	24
The right to light contrasted with other rights	24
Restrictive covenants	24
Leases	26
<b>Chapter 3</b>	
<b>Extent of Rights of Light</b>	<b>27</b>
Test of sufficiency	27
Generally	27
Relevance of actual and prospective layout and uses of affected areas	30

Relevance of impact of loss of light on particular locations within the affected area	32
Right to extraordinary light	33
The test of whether there has been an actionable interference with light	37
Generally	37
Stained or frosted glass	43
Relevance of natural light from other sources	43
Where existing windows do not provide adequate light	45
Relevance of artificial light	46
<b>Chapter 4</b>	
<b>Buildings and Structures Capable of Enjoying Rights of Light</b>	<b>49</b>
General	49
Decided cases under s 3 of the Prescription Act 1832	50
The type of aperture protected	54
Aperture must be defined	54
Partially obscured windows	55
Apertures between different parts of the same building	56
Incomplete/unoccupied premises	56
<b>Chapter 5</b>	
<b>Acquisition of Rights of Light I – By Acts of the Parties</b>	<b>59</b>
Summary	59
Express grant	59
Unregistered land	59
Registered land	60
Grant by implication	62
Grant under the rule in <i>Wheeldon v Burrows</i>	64
Sale of part of land, where vendor retains the remainder	64
Lease of part of land, where the landlord retains the remainder	65
Law of Property Act 1925, s 62	66
Law of Property Act 1925, s 63	68
Under the obligation not to derogate from grant	69
Under statutory provisions	70
<b>Chapter 6</b>	
<b>Acquisition of Rights of Light II – By Prescription</b>	<b>73</b>
Summary	73
Common law prescription	74
Lost modern grant	81
Prescription Act 1832, s 3	85
Who can claim a right of light under s 3?	86
The enjoyment of light must be for the benefit of a building	87
Apertures	87
Enjoyment of light	87
What is a building?	88

There must be continuous actual enjoyment of the right for at least 20 years back from the date on which the action asserting or challenging that right was commenced	89
The enjoyment must have been without consent or agreement in writing	91
There must not be an interruption of the enjoyment	93
The right to acquire an easement of light under s 3 does not run against the Crown	96
Landlord and tenant	97
Miscellaneous points	101
Ecclesiastical property	102
Unlawful, or illegal enjoyment of light	103
<b>Chapter 7</b>	
<b>Acquisition of Rights of Light III – Prevention of Acquisition</b>	<b>107</b>
Summary	107
By agreement	107
By physical interruption	109
By the use of the Rights of Light Act 1959	110
<b>Chapter 8</b>	
<b>Extinguishment of Rights of Light</b>	<b>117</b>
Summary	117
Extinguishment by agreement	117
Extinguishment by unity of ownership	120
Permanent abandonment	120
Interruption	125
Actual interruption	125
Notional interruption	128
Demolition or alteration of the dominant building	135
Extinguishment under statutory provisions	139
Section 237 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 – introduction	139
Policy of section 237	141
Requirements of section 237	141
Compensation	145
Challenge to a decision to acquire or appropriate	147
Does the planning purpose now contemplated fall within the ambit of the purpose for which the land was acquired or appropriated	147
Acquisition by a local authority and disposal to developer	148
Government Guidance	149
Summary	150
Compulsory purchase	150
The effect of the exercise of the statutory powers to override or acquire	151

<b>Chapter 9</b>	
<b>Deeds Regulating Rights of Light</b>	<b>155</b>
Generally	155
A general note on the construction of deeds regulating rights of light	156
Terms providing for payment of compensation	156
Terms allowing infringement of existing lights	157
Terms authorising the construction of new buildings	158
Terms excluding the future acquisition of rights of light	163
Legal effectiveness of rights of light deeds	164
Between original parties	164
Position of successors in title	164
The effect of the Contracts (Rights of Third Parties) Act 1999	167
Drafting issues – plans, drawings and sections	169
Perpetuities	170
Checklist for the parties and their advisers.	171
<b>Chapter 10</b>	
<b>Proceedings for Infringement of Rights of Light – Proceedings in Court, Appeals from Court Decisions and Cases in the Property Chamber</b>	<b>175</b>
Introduction	175
Causes of action	175
Parties	177
Claimants	177
Defendants	178
Limitation of claims	181
(i) Damages at common law for private nuisance	181
(ii) Breach of contract, or covenant	181
(iii) Claims in equity; injunctions and damages in lieu	182
Disputes over rights of light in the courts	183
Disputes over rights of light – practice and procedure in outline	185
Evidence – the ‘basics’	186
Sources of evidence	188
Oral evidence	188
Documentary evidence	189
Expert evidence	191
Procedure in private rights of light disputes – in outline	192
Conducting the claim	192
Generally	192
Starting the claim	192
Continuing and managing the claim	197
The hearing of the claim	202
Preparation for the hearing	202
Judgment and afterwards	206
Jurisdiction and practice in the Property Chamber	222
Background and jurisdiction	224
Background	224
Jurisdiction	224

Procedure	226
Directions for and conduct of hearings in the Property Chamber	229
The effect of the reference to the Property Chamber on time running under s 2 and 4 of the Prescription Act 1832	229
Orders that can be made as to rights of light disputes	229
Costs	230
Appeals and reviews of decisions	230
(i) A review of the PCJ's decision	230
(ii) Appeals	231
Advantages and disadvantages of using the adjudication procedure	232
<b>Chapter 11</b>	
<b>Remedies for Infringements of Rights of Light – Injunctions</b>	<b>233</b>
Introduction	233
Types of injunction	233
The status of authorities in which the court has exercised its discretion concerning whether to grant an injunction	234
Interim injunctions	234
Introduction	234
'Not on notice' interim injunctions	235
<i>American Cyanamid Co v Ethicon</i>	237
Serious question to be tried	237
Adequacy of damages	239
'Balance of convenience'	240
Mandatory interim injunctions	242
Circumstances in which the <i>American Cyanamid</i> guidelines have no application	244
The claimant's cross undertaking	245
Permanent injunctions	250
The discretion to refuse injunctive relief (and to award damages in lieu of an injunction)	250
The circumstances in which the jurisdiction to award damages in lieu of an injunction will be exercised	252
There should be no preconceived inclination either way	255
No rigid guidance	255
The defendant's conduct	256
The public interest	258
The continued relevance of the Shelfer 'working rule'	261
'... and the case is one in which it would be oppressive to the defendant to grant an injunction'	265
Mandatory injunctions	267
Quia timet injunctions	270
<b>Chapter 12</b>	
<b>Remedies for Infringements of Rights of Light – Declarations</b>	<b>273</b>

<b>Chapter 13</b>	
<b>Remedies for Infringements of Rights of Light – Damages and Abatement</b>	<b>277</b>
Quantification of damages in lieu of an injunction	277
Negotiating damages	277
Parties to the hypothetical negotiation	279
Date of the hypothetical negotiation	280
Form of the negotiation	281
Conduct	283
Evidence: predicted and actual profits	284
<i>Lawrence v Fen Tigers</i> has cast doubt on whether damages in lieu should be assessed on a negotiating damages basis	285
Common law damages	289
Abatement	292
General	292
Abatement and the criminal law	293
Limits of the remedy	295
Relationship of abatement with legal proceedings for the same wrong	298
<b>Chapter 14</b>	
<b>Measurement and Valuation of Light</b>	<b>301</b>
Methods of measurement	301
Percy Waldram	301
What is meant by light in rights to light terms?	302
What is being measured?	304
How is it measured?	305
Valuation of loss of light	316
The area measurement	316
Valuation	320
Applying the law	321
<b>Chapter 15</b>	
<b>Rights of Light and Planning Law</b>	<b>325</b>
Summary	325
The extent to which light is protected by planning law and policies	326
The relevance of rights to light in the decision-making process	328
The effect of planning permission on pre-existing rights of light	333
Current planning policies relating to light	335
Powers of local planning authorities to override private rights of light	336
<b>Chapter 16</b>	
<b>Conveyancing Issues which Affect Rights of Light</b>	<b>339</b>
Introduction	339
Rights of light and registered titles	339
Where titles were registered and dealings took place before 13 October 2003	339
The dominant land	339
The servient land	340



Both dominant and servient land; no express grant	341
Both dominant and servient titles – express agreements relating to rights to light not completed by deed, creating equitable easements	341
Both dominant and servient titles – easements of light created by implication	342
Both dominant and servient titles – prescriptive rights	343
Transitional provisions	343
Where titles have been registered and dealings take place after 13 October 2003	345
First registration	345
Registered dispositions	346
Practical points arising under LRA 2002	347
Rights to light and unregistered titles	348
Landlord and tenant issues	349
Searches and inquiries	350
General conveyancing points in both registered and unregistered titles	350
<b>Chapter 17</b>	
<b>Human Rights</b>	<b>353</b>
Introduction	353
HRA 1998	354
Protection of private and family life and the home	356
Protection of property rights	360
Discrimination and Art 14	366
<b>Chapter 18</b>	
<b>The High Hedges Legislation</b>	<b>369</b>
Summary	369
Background to the legislation	369
Use of the high hedges legislation	370
Preliminaries	370
What is covered in this chapter?	372
What property does the 2003 Act protect?	372
Who can use the 2003 Act?	373
What has to be proved to found a complaint under the 2003 Act?	375
What has to be the subject of the complaint?	376
What is a ‘high hedge’?	377
Causation	379
How can a complaint be made?	381
Stage 1	381
Stage 2	381
How are complaints dealt with?	382
Stage 1	382
Stage 2	383
What must the local authority take into account at this stage?	383
Stage 3	384
What action will the local authority take?	384

What is a remedial notice?	384
What effect does a remedial notice have?	386
How should a local authority approach the question of issuing a remedial notice?	386
Appeals	387
Costs of complaints and appeals	389
Other matters: offences and enforcement	389
Offences	389
Enforcement	390
Conclusion	392
<b>Chapter 19</b>	
<b>Insuring Rights of Light</b>	<b>395</b>
The availability of insurance	395
Cover for infringement of rights of light	395
Freehold and leasehold rights	396
The nature of the proposed development to be covered by the insurance policy	396
Geographical area	396
Not always an alternative to negotiation	396
Why insure?	396
Underwriting and information required	397
The required information	398
The titles to the development site and the affected properties	398
Right of light surveyors report and planning drawing	399
Incidental information	399
Counsel's opinions (if any)	399
The property and surrounding area	400
A development requiring a planning application	400
Local reaction	401
The cost – premiums	402
Policy cover	402
Due diligence	404
Claims	405
<b>Chapter 20</b>	
<b>Proposals for Reform</b>	<b>407</b>
Introduction	407
The genesis of the Report and Bill	407
Headline proposals in the Report and Bill	408
(i) Acquisition of a right of light by long enjoyment	408
(ii) Bringing the acquisition of the right to an end	408
(iii) Abandonment	408
(iv) Discharge and modification of easements of light and other easements	409
(v) Putting the dominant owner on notice of the proposed development and reducing or removing the risk of an injunction	409

(vi) Injunction or damages?	410
Limits to the reform	410
Advantages and difficulties of the proposed reforms	411
The future of the proposed reforms	412
<b>Appendix 1</b>	
<b>Statutes</b>	<b>413</b>
<b>Appendix 2</b>	
<b>Statutory Instruments</b>	<b>465</b>
<b>Appendix 3</b>	
<b>Other Materials</b>	<b>481</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>493</b>