

# Probate Disputes and Remedies

Third Edition

Dawn Goodman  
Solicitor and Partner, Withers LLP

Paul Hewitt  
Solicitor and Partner, Withers LLP

Henrietta Mason  
Solicitor, Withers LLP

Published by  
Jordan Publishing Limited  
21 St Thomas Street  
Bristol BS1 6JS

Whilst the publishers and the author have taken every care in preparing the material included in this work, any statements made as to the legal or other implications of particular transactions are made in good faith purely for general guidance and cannot be regarded as a substitute for professional advice. Consequently, no liability can be accepted for loss or expense incurred as a result of relying in particular circumstances on statements made in this work.

© Dawn Goodman, Paul Hewitt, Henrietta Mason 2014

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any way or by any means, including photocopying or recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher.

Crown Copyright material is reproduced with kind permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

**British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978 1 84661 851 2

Typeset by Letterpart Limited, Caterham on the Hill, Surrey CR3 5XL

Printed in Great Britain by CPI Antony Rowe, Chippenham and Eastbourne

# CONTENTS

Dedication – Brendan Hall deceased	v
Preface	vii
Preface to the First Edition	ix
Table of Cases	xxiii
Table of Statutes	xxxvii
Table of Statutory Instruments	xli

## Part I

### Pre-Death Issues

#### Chapter 1

<b>Disputes Arising out of Lifetime Transactions</b>	<b>3</b>
Validity of lifetime gifts	3
Capacity to make a gift	3
Practical considerations	5
Gifts made by an attorney or deputy	5
Other lifetime transactions	6
Undue influence	6
Presumed undue influence	6
Relationship between the parties	7
Nature of the transaction	7
Other factors	8
Rebutting the presumption	8
Actual undue influence	9
Other arguments for/against gifts	9
Deathbed gifts	9
The rule in <i>Strong v Bird</i>	11
Presumption against double portions	11
Joint ownership and resulting trusts	12
Presumption of advancement	13
Real property held in joint names	14
Joint bank accounts	14
Undue influence	16
Role of personal representatives	16

#### Chapter 2

<b>Court of Protection</b>	<b>17</b>
Statutory wills	17
Failure to execute and seal	17

Challenge to the statutory will	18
Death interrupting proceedings	18
Accounts	19
Authority to authorise gifts	19
Ademption	20

## **Part II**

### **Death and Burial Disputes**

#### **Chapter 3**

<b>Coroners' Investigations</b>	<b>23</b>
Background	23
A reported death	24
The inquest	26
Further information	28

#### **Chapter 4**

<b>Disputes – Burial and Ashes</b>	<b>29</b>
No property in a corpse	29
Method of disposal	29
The Deceased's wishes	29
Duty of disposal	30
Hierarchy of those with a duty to dispose of the body	30
Points to note and exceptions to the hierarchy	31
Parental responsibility	31
Householders and those lawfully in possession of the body	32
Local authority	32
Coroner's inquiry	32
Donation of body parts	32
Senior Courts Act 1981, s 116	32
Conflicts between those equally entitled	34
Funeral expenses	35
Headstones	36
Exhumation	37
Practice and procedure	38

## **Part III**

### **Obtaining the Grant – Disputes and Resolutions**

#### **Chapter 5**

<b>Obtaining the Will</b>	<b>43</b>
Securing the will	43
Witness summons	43
Last will or codicil	43
Previous documents	44
Proceedings already issued	44
Professional executors and advisers	44
Examination by the court	45

<b>Chapter 6</b>	
<b>Entitlement to the Grant and Applications to Remove Personal Representatives</b>	<b>47</b>
Who may apply?	47
Actions against those claiming entitlement	47
Citations	48
Applications under SCA 1981, s 116 to remove personal representatives	50
Introduction	50
Main uses	50
Procedure	51
Applications under Administration of Justice Act 1985 (AJA 1985), s 50 to remove personal representatives	51
Introduction	51
Procedure	52
Intermeddling	52
What constitutes intermeddling?	53
Extent of liability	53
<b>Chapter 7</b>	
<b>Blocking the Grant: Caveats</b>	<b>55</b>
Entering a caveat	55
Expiry and renewal	55
Warning and appearance	56
Withdrawing the caveat	56
Standing search	56
When to lodge a caveat	57
Doubt about validity of a testamentary document	57
Dispute about who should be personal representative	57
Where a citation is to be taken out	57
When a caveat should not be lodged	58
<b>Chapter 8</b>	
<b>Limited and Discretionary Grants</b>	<b>59</b>
Introduction	59
Administration pending determination of a probate claim	59
Administration ad colligenda bona	60
Grant to part of the estate	61
<b>Chapter 9</b>	
<b>The Foreign Element</b>	<b>63</b>
Introduction	63
English deceased: foreign assets	64
English wills and foreign wills	64
English executors and foreign assets	64
A formally valid will in a foreign jurisdiction	65
Other problems with foreign estates	68
Situs	68

Identifying the assets and ownership structure	68
Tax	69
Foreign deceased: English assets	71
A valid will that can be proved in England	71
Who can take out the grant?	71
Material validity of the will	72
Matrimonial property	73
Practice and procedure	73

## **Part IV**

### **Problems with the Will**

#### **Chapter 10**

<b>Rectification</b>	<b>79</b>
What the court is required to ask	79
Clerical error	80
Failure to understand instructions	81
Burden of proof	82
The dividing line with negligence	82
Costs and independent legal advice	84
Procedure	84
Uncontested	84
Contested	85
Compromise and inheritance tax	86
Time-limits and protection for personal representatives	86
Personal representatives' duties and disclosure of will-drafting files	87
Signing the wrong document	88
HM Revenue & Customs	88

#### **Chapter 11**

<b>Construction</b>	<b>89</b>
Background	89
Principles	89
Presumption against intestacy	90
Gifts to family	90
Presumption that a will is rational and not capricious	90
General rules as to evidence	90
Practice and Procedure	91
Resolving non-contentious construction issues	91
Resolving contentious construction issues	92
Costs	93

#### **Chapter 12**

<b>Validity Disputes</b>	<b>95</b>
Validity: essential elements	95
Due execution	95
Basic principles	95
Signature	95
Witnesses and attestation	96

Presumption of due execution	97
Revocation	98
Burden of proof and presumptions	99
Testamentary capacity	100
Presumption of capacity	101
Proof of actual understanding or inference of capacity	102
Capacity at execution	103
The effect of drugs or alcohol	103
The effect of bereavement	103
Knowledge and approval	104
Reviewing the evidence	105
Solicitors benefiting under a will	106
Undue influence	107
Standard of proof in undue influence	108
Fraud	109
Fraudulent calumny	109
Forgery	110
Practice and procedure	110
Pre-claim investigations	110
Standing search	110
Caveat	111
Collating evidence	111
Further investigations	116
Joint or sole approach	116
Proceedings	117
Jurisdiction	117
Limitation	117
Pre-action	117
Commencement and procedure	118
Evidence about testamentary documents	118
Parties or persons who may be affected	119
Service of the claim form	119
Defence and counterclaim	119
Revocation of existing grant	119
Judgment in default	119
Discontinuance	119
Compromise	120
Mediation or conciliation	120
Settlement before trial	120
Costs	121

## Part V

### Disputes in the Estate Administration

#### Chapter 13

#### Claims against Personal Representatives 127

#### Introduction 127

Accounts, inquiries and inventories	127
Application under the Non-Contentious Probate Rules 1987 (NCPR 1987)	128
Application to the Public Trustee	129
Application for accounts and inquiries or inventories	129
Disclosure and inspection of trust documents	131
The general position	131
Devastavit, breach of trust and fiduciary duty	133
Devastavit	134
Examples of devastavit	134
Breach of trust	136
Common breaches of trust	137
Breach of fiduciary duty	140
Action for devastavit, breach of trust or breach of fiduciary duty	141
Extent of liability	142
Defences to claims	143
On the merits	143
Section 27 of the Trustee Act 1925	144
Section 26 of the Trustee Act 1925	144
Court order	144
Section 61 of the Trustee Act 1925	145
Limitation	145
Doctrine of laches	147
Acquiescence or release by beneficiaries	147
Exclusion, exoneration or exemption clauses	148
Procedure	149
Pre-action procedure	149
Statements of case	149
Case management system	150
Detailed budgets	152
Disclosure	152
Evidence	154
Preparation for trial	155
Interim applications	156
Summary judgment	156
Security for costs	157
Pre-emptive costs orders	157
Injunctions	158
Specific disclosure and further information	159
Striking out	159
Removal and substitution	160
Application for removal or substitution of personal representatives	160
Action for removal of will trustees	161
Removal under s 41 of the Trustee Act 1925 or court's inherent power	161
Judicial trustees	162
Application for directions	163
Parties	164



Procedure	166
Costs implications	167
Costs	168
Costs capping	170
<i>Beddoe</i> orders: obtaining permission of the court to issue or defend proceedings	171
Action against a third party	171
Action against a beneficiary	173
Whole estate under attack	173
Action by a beneficiary	174
Procedure	174
<i>Benjamin</i> order	175
Procedure	176
Indemnities	176
<b>Chapter 14</b>	
<b>Disappointed Beneficiary Claims: Proprietary Estoppel and Constructive Trust Claims</b>	<b>179</b>
Introduction	179
Why bring a claim?	179
Comparison	179
Principles of proprietary estoppel claims	180
Assurance made to the claimant relating to an interest in specified land	180
The claimant must reasonably rely on the assurance	181
The claimant must suffer detriment in consequence of that reliance	182
It must be unconscionable for the representor to go back on the assurance	183
Remedy	183
Principles of constructive trust claims	184
There must be evidence of agreement in a constructive trust claim	184
The burden is on the claimant to show that the beneficial ownership differs from the legal ownership	184
Remedy for a constructive trust claim	185
Procedure	185
Generally	185
Evidence	185
Compromise	186
Inheritance tax consequences	186
<b>Chapter 15</b>	
<b>Mutual Wills</b>	<b>187</b>
Introduction	187
Definition of a mutual will	187
Effect of a mutual will	188
Evidential standard	188
Practice	189
Difficulties arising between the death of the testators	189

Drafting	190
<b>Chapter 16</b>	
<b>Disappointed Beneficiary Claims: Claims under the Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependants) Act 1975</b>	<b>191</b>
Does the 1975 Act apply?	191
Domicile	191
Intention to abandon domicile of origin	192
Difficulties with the domicile as the basis of jurisdiction	192
Time-limit to bring a claim	193
Who can apply?	195
Spouse or civil partner of the deceased	195
Former spouse or former civil partner of the deceased	196
Any person living with the deceased as husband, wife or civil partner for 2 years immediately before the death	197
Child of the deceased	198
Treated by the deceased as a child of the family	198
Any person who immediately before the death of the deceased was being maintained by the deceased	198
The court's approach	199
Reasonable financial provision	200
Application by spouse or civil partner of the deceased	200
Other categories of applicant	200
Matters to which the court is to have regard in ascertaining reasonable provision	200
Additional factors	201
Orders that can be made by the court	202
Interim orders	202
Property available for financial provision	202
Sections 8 to 11 of the 1975 Act	203
Issues arising in relation to ss 10 and 11	204
State benefits	205
Application	206
Claims by spouses and civil partners	206
The divorce hypothesis	206
Impact of ancillary relief cases on 1975 Act claims	206
Claims by other categories of applicant	210
Claims by former spouses	211
Claims by cohabittees	211
Claim by a child or someone treated as a child of the family	212
Estrangement	214
Treated as a child of the family	214
Claim by dependant	214
Practice and procedure	214
Pre-claim investigations	214
Pre-action conduct	215
Collating evidence	216

Proceedings	218
Time-limit	218
Jurisdiction	218
Commencement and proceedings	219
Parties and joinder	220
Role of personal representatives	220
Service of claim form	220
Compromise	221
Who can compromise?	221
How to compromise	221
Taxation issues	222
Costs	222
Personal representatives' costs	224
<b>Chapter 17</b>	
<b>Disappointed Beneficiary Claims: Fatal Accident Claims</b>	<b>225</b>
Law Reform (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1934	225
Heads of claim	225
Recoverable benefits	225
Contributory negligence	225
Fatal Accidents Act 1976	226
Claimants	226
Heads of claim	226
Bereavement	226
Loss of dependency	227
Disregard of benefits	227
Contributory negligence	228
Interaction with Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependents) Act 1975 claims	228
<b>Chapter 18</b>	
<b>Creditor Claims and Insolvent Estates</b>	<b>229</b>
Payment of debts	229
Order of payment of debts	229
Insolvent or potentially insolvent estates	230
Methods of administration	230
Order for payment of debts on insolvency	230
Formal or informal administration	231
Protection for personal representatives	232
Trustee Act 1925, s 27	233
Administration of Estates Act 1971, s 10(2)	233
<i>Plene administravit</i>	233
Trustee Act, s 61	233
Practice and procedure	234

<b>Chapter 19</b>	
<b>Tax Evasion, Foreign Taxes and Criminal Matters</b>	<b>237</b>
Disclosure to domestic authorities of information relating to tax and benefits	237
Enforcement of foreign revenue claims	240
Disclosure and other assistance to foreign revenue authorities	241
Domestic crime and money laundering legislation	242
International crime and money laundering	244
<b>Part VI</b>	
<b>Claims against Professional Advisers</b>	
<b>Chapter 20</b>	
<b>Claims against Professional Advisers</b>	<b>249</b>
What claims may be made?	249
Claims against those drafting and advising in relation to wills, trusts and estate planning	249
A claim in negligence	249
Will drafting	250
Estate planning	251
Limitation period	252
Contractual claims	253
Claims against professionals for negligent advice to personal representatives/trustees	253
Claims in relation to costs	254
Solicitors Act taxation	254
Costs of taxation	254
Action for an account	254
Practice and procedure	254
Claims in against those drafting and advising in relation to wills, trusts, estate planning and estate administration	254
What claim to bring	254
Pre-action conduct	255
Commencing the claim	255
Mitigation	255
Rectification of wills	255
Equitable rectification	256
Mistake and Hastings Bass	256
Claims against professionals in their capacity as personal representatives or trustees	257
Claims in relation to costs	257
Pre-action	257
Commencing the claim	257
Time-limits	257
Case management and final hearing	258
Settlement	258

<b>Appendix 1</b>	
<b>Probate Disputes</b>	<b>259</b>
Special contributions	262
Length of marriage	263
Non-matrimonial assets: property acquired prior to the marriage and inherited assets	264
Post-separation accrual	267
Treatment of marital agreements	271
Periodical payments, quantum and term	273
<b>Appendix 2</b>	
<b>Sample Documents and Materials</b>	<b>275</b>
Sample 1: Subpoena requiring production of a testamentary document	275
Sample 2: Affidavit in support of an application under Senior Courts Act 1981, s 123 for the issue of a subpoena requiring the production of a testamentary document	276
Sample 3: Affidavit in support of application for appointment of administrator	277
Sample 4: Caveat	278
Sample 5: Warning to caveat	279
Sample 6: Affidavit of service of warning	280
Sample 7: Appearance	281
Sample 8: Application for standing search	282
Sample 9: Affidavit in support of application for grant ad colligenda bona	283
Sample 10: Claim form requesting court to decree probate of a will in solemn form in the context of a validity dispute	285
Sample 11: Claim form requesting court to pronounce against the purported last will of the deceased in favour of an earlier will on grounds of lack of validity	286
Sample 12: Witness statement of testamentary scripts	287
Sample 13: Letter requesting <i>Larke v Nugus</i> Statement	288
Sample 14: Letter requesting medical records	290
Sample 15: Letter to GP requesting views on capacity	291
Sample 16: Application for an account by executor under CPR Part 64	293
Sample 17: Application under the Administration of Justice Act 1985, s 50 by executor for removal of co-executor	294
Sample 18: Witness statement in support of application under Administration of Justice Act 1985, s 50 by executor for removal of co-executor	295
Sample 19: <i>Beddoe</i> application	296
Sample 20: Application by surviving spouse under the Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependants) Act 1975	297
Sample 21: Witness statement in support of surviving spouse claim under Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependants) Act 1975	298

Sample 22: Witness statement of personal representative in reply to application under Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependants) Act 1975	300
Sample 23: Checklist when taking instructions regarding claims under the Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependants) Act 1975	301
Sample 24: List of documents to be collated for 1975 Act claim/defence	302
Sample 25: Heads of agreement on settlement of claim	303
Sample 26: Tomlin order (to which attach heads of agreement)	304
<b>Index</b>	<b>305</b>