

Fiduciary Duties: Directors and Employees

Second Edition

Andrew Stafford QC

Stuart Ritchie QC

Published by
Jordan Publishing Limited
21 St Thomas Street, Bristol BS1 6JS

Whilst the publishers and the author have taken every care in preparing the material included in this work, any statements made as to the legal or other implications of particular transactions are made in good faith purely for general guidance and cannot be regarded as a substitute for professional advice. Consequently, no liability can be accepted for loss or expense incurred as a result of relying in particular circumstances on statements made in this work.

© Jordan Publishing Limited 2015

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any way or by any means, including photocopying or recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher.

Crown Copyright material is reproduced with kind permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978 1 84661 558 0

Typeset by Letterpart Limited, Caterham on the Hill, Surrey CR3 5XL

Printed in Great Britain by Hobbs the Printers Limited, Totton, Hampshire SO40 3WX

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	v
Foreword to the First Edition	vii
Preface to the First Edition	xi
Preface to the Second Edition	xiii
Table of Cases	xxix
Table of Statutes	xlix
Table of Statutory Instruments	li
Chapter 1	
Introduction	1
Chapter 2	
Fiduciary Duties	5
Introduction	5
Overview	5
Summary of the current law concerning directors' and employees' fiduciary duties	5
General duties under the 2006 Companies Act	8
Continuing relevance of fiduciary duties	9
The fiduciary principle	10
Three fiduciary doctrines?	10
The relationship of trust and confidence: loyalty	11
Duties peculiar to fiduciaries	11
The meaning of 'fiduciary': undivided loyalty and the denial of self-interest	12
Self-denying loyalty: its application to directors and employees	16
Duties which are 'peculiarly fiduciary'	18
The relevance of remedy	24
Two strands to directors' fiduciary duties: loyalty and the control of discretionary power	24
Undivided loyalty: conflicts of interest and unauthorised profits	32
The 'no conflict' rule	32
Conflicts of duty and duty – the director of two companies	33
The 'no profit' rule	36
Sections 175 to 177 Companies Act 2006	37
Duration of 'no conflict' and 'no profit' duties	39
Inter-relationship of the 'no conflict' and 'no profit' rules	39
Rules or duties?	41

Self-dealing: statutory disclosure of interests under s 177– a new civil claim?	42
The provisions under the 2006 Act	43
Concepts underlying the ‘no conflict’ and ‘no profit’ duties	44
Deterrence of self-interest	44
Strict application	45
Honesty and good faith irrelevant	46
What would have happened is irrelevant	46
Interests – direct and indirect	47
‘Possible conflicts’	48
Application of the ‘no conflict’ and ‘no profit’ duties	49
Controlling the exercise of directors’ fiduciary powers: ‘proper purpose’ and ‘good faith/best interests’ duties	51
Section 171: the duty of a director to act within his powers	51
Section 172: duty to promote the success of the company	52
Content of the duty to promote	55
<i>Item Software (UK) Ltd v Fassibi</i> – the facts	56
<i>Item Software v Fassibi</i> : the decision of the Court of Appeal	56
Content of duty to disclose	58
Duration of duty to disclose	60
To whom should the disclosure be made?	61
Effect of breach of duty to disclose	61
Section 173: Duty to exercise independent judgment	63
‘Fiduciary’ disclosure – a source of confusion	64
Concepts of disclosure in fiduciary law	64
Employee fiduciary disclosure obligations	68
Discussion	68
The rules in operation	71
Limited liability partnerships: <i>F&C Alternative Investments v Barthelemy</i>	71
Employees	74
By whom and to whom are fiduciary duties owed?	76
Directors and de facto directors	76
Shadow directors	78
Employees	80
Duties to the company	80
Duties to third parties	80
Piercing the corporate veil	81
Duties to shareholders	81
Comment	83
Duties to creditors	84
Defences/relief from liability	84
Authorisation: fully informed consent	85
Employees	87
Acquiescence	87
Ratification	88
Consent of all shareholders – the <i>Duomatic</i> principle	90

Section 1157 relief	92
Principles	93
Chapter 3	
Employees Owing Fiduciary Duties	97
Introduction	97
Scope of chapter	97
Background to claims against employees for breach of fiduciary duty	98
Concepts underlying the fiduciary doctrine	100
Loyalty, influence and confidentiality	100
Who is a fiduciary?	101
What are fiduciary duties?	102
Breach	103
Remedies	104
Fiduciary duties: the status approach	105
<i>Attorney-General v Blake</i>	105
Wider recognition of the fiduciary nature of the employment relationship in Australia	107
Fiduciary duties – the agency approach	110
<i>Canadian Aero Service Ltd v O’Malley</i>	110
An employee’s duty to account for profits	113
An employer’s claim to profits in law and equity	113
<i>Reading v the King</i>	114
Fiduciary duties: the modern approach – <i>University of Nottingham v Fishel</i>	119
Summary	119
The facts	120
Elias J’s analysis	120
Application of the principles	123
Approval of <i>Fishel</i> in Court of Appeal	124
(1) <i>Helmet Integrated Systems Ltd v Tunnard</i>	124
(2) <i>Customer Systems plc v Ranson</i>	127
Discussion	130
Tension between <i>Fishel</i> and <i>Attorney-General v Blake</i>	130
<i>Fishel</i> and <i>Canadian Aero Services</i> reconciled?	133
The agent/servant distinction – an unhelpful approach	133
Tension between <i>Fishel</i> and <i>Attorney-General v Reading</i>	135
The principles in practice	137
General	137
A suggested approach	138
The primacy of the employment contract	139
Identifying the obligations owed by the ‘fiduciary’	139
The foundation of the contractual relationship	140
Acting solely in the interests of the employer	142
The relevance of discretion	143
The effect of contractual control on the existence of a fiduciary relationship?	144

Relationship between the contractual relationship and a fiduciary relationship	145
Illustration through case law	147
Cases where fiduciary relationship established	147
Fiduciary relationship not established	153
Situations which are likely to give rise to the imposition of fiduciary duties	155
Employees having control of company property	155
Employees exercising a management function	155
Autonomous employees	155
Client/supplier-facing employees	156
Fraud	156
Bribery	156
Contracting into a fiduciary relationship?	157
Chapter 4	
Contractual Issues	159
Introduction	159
The duty of fidelity	159
Origins of the duty of fidelity	160
The content and limits of the duty of fidelity	163
Competing	166
Preparatory acts	166
Taking the employer's information – defensive acts	172
Spare time	172
Team moves	173
Garden leave	176
Duration of the duty of fidelity	179
Duties to disclose misconduct	180
Covenants in restraint of trade	186
The enforceability of covenants	187
Legitimate interests	187
Confidential information	187
Staff stability	189
Goodwill	190
Evaluating covenants	190
Introducing covenants	191
The effect of TUPE on covenants	193
Repudiatory breach	196
The implied term of mutual trust and confidence	201
Remedies	204
Springboard injunctions	204
Account of profits and restitutionary/'hypothetical bargain' damages	209
Chapter 5	
Unlawful Competition	215
Introduction	215
Scope of chapter	215

Corporate opportunities	215
Preparing to compete	217
Confidential information	219
The relevant duties and their duration	220
Duties	220
No conflict/no profit	220
Good faith	222
Duration of fiduciary duties	222
The general rule	222
Liability to account for profits	223
Exceptions to the general rule	224
No powers to exercise: exclusion/garden leave	224
Resignation of directorship; continuing employment relationship	226
Resignation of employment; continuing directorship	226
Exploitation of maturing business opportunities	227
Corporate opportunities	227
Basis of liability	227
The principles in operation	228
Fiduciaries acting in more than one capacity	229
Common scenarios	230
Diversion of company/employer's contract or opportunity	230
Exploitation of opportunity which comes to the attention of the fiduciary in his fiduciary capacity but which the company/employer cannot/would not exploit	231
Scope of business	232
Exploitation of opportunity coming to attention of fiduciary in private capacity	234
Post-termination exploitation of 'maturing' business opportunity	239
Preparations to compete	249
General approach	250
Policy considerations	251
The 'no conflict' approach	254
<i>Balston Ltd v Headline Filters Ltd</i>	254
<i>Framlington Group plc & another v Anderson & others</i>	256
<i>Saatchi & Saatchi Company plc and others v Maurice Saatchi and others</i>	257
Conflicting interests	259
Termination – acting 'in concert'	259
The 'disclosure' approach	260
<i>British Midland Tool Ltd v Midland International Tooling Ltd</i>	260
<i>Item Software (UK) Ltd v Fassibi</i>	262
<i>Shepherds Investments Ltd v Walters</i>	263
Subsequent cases	265
Pragmatism – the way forward	268
<i>HISL v Tunnard</i>	269
<i>Foster Bryant Surveying Limited v Bryant</i>	270
Comment	272

Confidentiality	275
Overview	275
The nature of confidential information	277
The status of confidential information	279
Duration of confidentiality	279
The duty of confidence	280
Third parties and confidential information	282
Springboard relief	284
Confidential information received in the course of fiduciary relationship – the risk of post-termination misuse	286
<i>Bolkiah</i> – the right to a protective injunction	286
Contrasting approach towards directors and employees	287
Reversing the burden of proof: application of <i>Bolkiah</i> outside field of solicitors	288
Application of <i>Bolkiah</i> to directors and employees?	290
Chapter 6	
Bribes	293
Introduction	293
Section 176 Companies Act 2006	294
The nature of a bribe	295
Summary of the elements of bribery	296
No proof of inducement or intention to induce necessary	297
The need for classification	299
Special rules	299
The elements of bribery explained	300
(1) The need for fiduciary duties	300
Employees: a different test where bribes are concerned?	301
(2) Conflict of interest	307
No need for transactional connection	307
Materiality threshold	308
Bribe can be a gift or payment for services rendered	309
Job offers as bribes	310
Payment or benefit to agent acting in a different capacity	310
(3) Knowledge of the briber	311
Third party's knowledge of the agent's position	311
Dishonest assistance	313
Rescission without knowledge?	313
Attribution of knowledge to the briber	314
The time at which knowledge is acquired	315
(4) Secrecy	316
Defences	318
Disclosure and consent	318
Contributory negligence	320
Remedies	320
Restitution – money had and received	321
Claim against agent/employee	321
Claim against briber	323

Action in tort/deceit	324
No double recovery	325
Further consequences of a finding of bribery	326
The agent's 'right' to commission	326
The agent's 'right' to an allowance for skill and labour	328
Rights of the briber	329
Employee bribes in the absence of a fiduciary duty?	330
Breach of contract	331
Restitution – money had and received	331
Tort/deceit	332
Conclusion	332
Chapter 7	
Accessory Liability in Equity	333
Introduction	333
Liability in equity	334
Dishonest assistance in a breach of fiduciary duty	336
The facts in <i>Royal Brunei Airlines</i>	336
The modern basis of liability	336
The nature of the relevant fiduciary duties	337
Is 'trust property' necessary?	338
Dishonest assistance in a breach of confidence?	341
The nature of a claim for dishonest assistance	342
Types of assistance	343
Omissions as assistance	344
Timing/causal impact of the assistance	346
Knowledge of the trust or relevant fiduciary duty	348
The test of dishonesty	350
Causation	353
Knowing receipt	354
Constituents of a claim	355
Disposal of assets in breach of fiduciary duty	356
Property or assets	358
Beneficial receipt	361
Causal link between breach and receipt	362
Knowledge	362
Time at which knowledge is relevant	365
Contributory negligence	365
Contribution proceedings	367
The approach to assessing contribution	368
Chapter 8	
Vicarious Liability, Attribution, Imputation of Knowledge	371
Introduction	371
Three sets of rules	371
Vicarious liability	372
The rationale for vicarious liability	372
Summary of current position	373

‘Course of employment’ and intentional wrongdoing	374
Lister and the ‘close connection’ test	375
Forgery and ‘close connection’	379
Vicarious liability and deceit	380
‘Close connection’ and vicarious liability for dishonest assistance	382
Bribes and vicarious liability	383
Joint wrongdoers and vicarious liability	385
Attribution	388
The reason for rules of attribution	388
Sources of rules of attribution	389
Working examples	389
Directing mind and will	390
Imputation of knowledge – agency theory	391
The factual context in <i>El Ajou</i>	392
Hoffmann LJ’s category 3 – authority to receive communications	392
Limits on imputation by authority to receive communications	396
Hoffmann LJ’s category 4 – the agent’s duty to his principal	397
Hoffmann LJ’s category 2 – principal’s duty to investigate or disclose	399
Hoffmann LJ’s category 1 – agent’s knowledge affecting performance or terms of authorised contract	400
Imputation and the ‘forgetful’ director	401
Aggregating knowledge and states of mind	402
The ‘fraud exception’ or ‘ <i>Hampshire Land</i> Principle’	404
The rationale for the fraud exception	406
(1) <i>In Re Hampshire Land Company</i>	407
(2) <i>J C Houghton v Nothard, Lowes & Wells</i>	408
(3) <i>Belmont Finance Corporation v Williams Furniture Ltd</i>	409
(4) <i>Moore Stephens v Stone & Rolls Ltd</i>	410
(5) <i>Bilta (UK) Ltd v Nazir</i>	415
Chapter 9	
Proprietary and Personal Remedies	419
Introduction	419
Overview: the available remedies	420
Terminology	422
Following/tracing	422
The distinction between an account and an account of profits	423
Restitution and unjust enrichment	426
Remedies as of right/discretion	426
Election	427
Rescission	427
Personal remedies	428
Account of profits	428
Principles underlying fiduciary accountability	428
Account of profits – duty or remedy?	429
Rationale	429
What profits fall within the obligation to account?	429

Disproportionate remedy	430
The requirement for a nexus between the breach of fiduciary duty and the profits made	432
A fiduciary's liability to account for profits made by a third party	433
'Single asset' profits and 'business' profits	437
Loss of nexus through effluxion of time	439
A future relaxation of the law?	442
No apportionment possible – compound interest	442
A two-stage process	444
Assessment of the profits	445
General matters	445
Tax	446
Equitable allowances	447
Illustration through case law	447
Summary of relevant considerations	454
Equitable compensation	455
The position generally	455
<i>AIB Group (UK) plc v Redler</i>	456
Availability of remedy for breach of fiduciary duty	461
Breach of duty – disclosure?	464
Causation and remoteness	466
Loss of a chance	468
Assessing the compensation	468
Forfeiture of Fees/Remuneration	469
Proprietary remedies	472
Three proprietary remedies, not one	472
Constructive trust	473
Definition	473
Institutional or remedial?	473
Application where property held by fiduciary	474
No application in cases of dishonest assistance	475
Historical development	476
What is property?	481
Proprietary rights in businesses	482
Inter-relationship between account of profits and proprietary remedy	482
Property rights in businesses: discussion	487
Proprietary relief and limitation	490
Secondary liability: remedies	492
Remedies for dishonest assistance	492
Equitable compensation	493
Basis of liability?	494
Account of fiduciary's profit	496
Accountability for personal profits	496
Causation – account of profits and equitable compensation	498
Equitable allowance in respect of dishonest assistance	500
Proprietary remedies	500
Discussion	501
Conclusion	503

Compound interest and dishonest assistance	504
Knowing receipt	504
Chapter 10	
Limitation	505
Introduction	505
The statutory provisions	505
A simple summary	507
Breach of trust – section 21	508
<i>Williams v Central Bank of Nigeria</i>	508
Three conditions of applicability	509
Pre-existing obligation	510
Substance of the pre-existing obligation	511
Connection between the obligation and the property	513
Is fraud enough?	514
Company directors	515
Employees	516
Proprietary relief and limitation	516
Duty to account – section 23	518
Directors and employees	519
Limitation by analogy	519
How a court of equity ‘would have’ proceeded	520
Equitable relief	521
Fraud or concealment – section 32	523
Section 212 of the Insolvency Act 1986	524
Laches	524
Dishonest assistance in a breach of fiduciary duty	525
Knowing receipt	527
Chapter 11	
Procedural Issues	529
Introduction	529
Statements of case	529
Standard and specific disclosure	533
Pre-action disclosure	534
Disclosure against non-parties	536
Summary judgment and striking out	538
Index	541